

BRAD LITTLE
GOVERNOR

Wendi Secrist
Executive Director



Trent Clark
Chair

B. J. Swanson
Vice Chair

WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL

317 West Main Street, Boise, Idaho 83735-0510

Apprenticeship Committee Meeting

Date: Wednesday, April 24, 2019

Time: 1:00 PM – 4:00 PM

Location: Idaho Career & Technical Education
3rd Floor – Clearwater Conference Room
650 W. Main Street
Boise, ID 83720

Meeting Conducted By: Angelique Rood, Chair of the Committee

Committee Members: Angelique Rood, Audrey Fletcher, ~~Dave Hannah~~, ~~Bill Kober~~, ~~Kelly Kolb~~, David Moore, Wendy Lundberg, ~~Scott Rassmussen~~, John Russ, Travis Woolsey, ~~Jamie Major~~, Adrian San Miguel, Davy Gadd, Ethan Secrist, Michelle Holt, Sean Kelly, Ed Husky, ~~Doug Park~~, Debra Ronneburg (proxy for Scott Rassmussen)

Guests: Jason Haase

Staff: Paige Nielebeck, Matthew Thomsen, Wendi Secrist, Caty Solace

Call to Order at 1:00 pm

Roll call - quorum met

***Approve Minutes from March 27, 2019 Meeting**

Q&A with Ivy Tech Community College

Mr. Russ introduced Teresa from Ivy Tech. Teresa gave a brief overview of Ivy Tech.

Is it an option for an apprentice to get their associate degree or is it included in their program?

- The first year of the program they tried to make it optional, but most people chose to get the associates. It is no additional cost to the student to get the degree. It is now a mandatory part of the program. Once the apprentice signs the agreement with the Department of Labor they become a student of Ivy Tech. Most apprentices come into the program with at least some college credit.

Have you seen an differential impact on those who participate in a registered program over those who don't?

- For the industry, it implies that they are investing in their employees. Their turnover rate decreases immensely. For the employees, they are getting better paying jobs and better benefits. They then choose to stay with the company.

BRAD LITTLE
GOVERNOR

Wendi Secrist
Executive Director



Trent Clark
Chair

B. J. Swanson
Vice Chair

WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL

317 West Main Street, Boise, Idaho 83735-0510

Are the apprenticeships for credit?

- The building trades are 100% for credit. They are coming to the college to take traditional courses. They do a lot of dual credit in Indiana. 90% of the apprenticeship classes are credit.

What led Ivy Tech to become a sponsor? Did they experience pushback from the institution?

- 6 or 7 small employers came to them and said they would like to do registered programs, but did not have the HR Support to support the process. Ivy Tech still tries to encourage businesses to go through the process alone because it is not too daunting. If the company does not have the capacity, Ivy Tech is there to help.
- Is there a charge for the sponsorship?
 - Currently no. It is something they have talked about. If it got to where the process is unmanageable then they might have to charge.
- There is no current pushback from education on being a sponsor. The pushback came from the instructors making sure that they maintain control and integrity of the programs.

Did becoming a sponsor increase participation?

- No. They only bring on about 10 new companies a year. Ivy Tech has only been a sponsor for two years. They currently have about 30 businesses involved. If they were to market the sponsorship the program would probably grow.

Are you able to leverage CTE at secondary level?

- Ivy Tech is very focused on leveraging CTE at the secondary level. Secondary schools have a lot of students taking dual credit courses. They are doing a lot of pre-apprenticeship, school to registered apprenticeship, etc. Students in these programs have the ability to walk away from high school with their CNA's. They are able to start earning their certifications in high school.

Do you do distance learning?

- Ivy Tech does a lot of distance learning and serves students all over the US.

Did you create your own curriculum?

- Yes. All of the curriculum is built by Ivy Tech.
- How does this get articulated into an associate degree?
 - The interdisciplinary workforce alignment technical credit is just enough to get them work ready. This feed directly into the AAS degree. They have created pathways for their 7 different sectors.

Is there any research in Idaho on the need for a degree other than to move up to specialty areas? Most students choose not to do a degree because their journeyman's card gets them the job they need.

- As a state, there are improvements that can be made to promote this is an opportunity. It has not been something people see as being important. However, if you talk to parents, they feel that continued

BRAD LITTLE
GOVERNOR

Wendi Secrist
Executive Director



Trent Clark
Chair

B. J. Swanson
Vice Chair

WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL

317 West Main Street, Boise, Idaho 83735-0510

education is important. Offering a degree alongside an apprenticeship could be a useful tool in overcoming perceptions. For employers, it's very important to show that you are willing to invest in continuing education for your employees and play a part in internal promotions. This is something that warrants further conversation and would require more outreach throughout the state. It is very important that Idahoans understand what opportunities are available through the colleges.

- One study looked at HS graduates and what they were considering for work opportunities and whether they would consider an apprenticeship. The reasons why they would not participate in an apprenticeship is there are no promotional opportunities (i.e. no path to degree). Idaho Power performed 2 studies and 72% of the people surveyed said they would have participated in education opportunities if they were available. In the second study, a large number of applicants surveyed said they chose one business over another because the company offered training that provided a pathway to a degree.
- Idaho is trying to grow apprenticeship outside the traditional industries. Candidates are going to be more interested in opportunities that may lead to being promoted and increasing their education and skills.
- We are also trying to change the perceptions of apprenticeships and show that its an option at a postsecondary level.
- If you can get one trade to buy-in to the program, then the hope is other trades will want to follow suit.

Who does Ivy Tech you partner with?

- We partner with any viable partner. We work a lot with economic development associations, chamber of commerce, high schools, etc. Not every company is going to want to do an apprenticeship, but we communicate what an apprenticeship offers.

Are general education courses free?

- They are funded by the state.

Ivy Tech works with a consortium to get feedback on the courses they offer. We ask them if there are additional courses that should be added, if we can create courses specifically for them, etc.

Do you have any agreements to offer credits for company sponsored program? How do you conduct reviews to determine how many credits goes towards an associate's degree?

- They have a standard crosswalk that they use for the credits (e.g. NIMS gets you a certain amount of credits). If it is not on the crosswalk they review it and apply what seems the most appropriate. Sometimes they require students to come in and test out of the course. They also look at the credentials of the teachers. If a student was taught by an uncredentialed teacher, they are unable to then accept those as credits.
- Most of the time companies send their employees to take traditional Ivy Tech courses. Sometimes they offer courses created specifically for the company. Sometimes they have the numbers to promote a closed course.

BRAD LITTLE
GOVERNOR

Wendi Secrist
Executive Director



Trent Clark
Chair

B. J. Swanson
Vice Chair

WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL

317 West Main Street, Boise, Idaho 83735-0510

What were some of the initial barriers to getting industry partners on-board?

- A lot of the larger companies do not care about the degrees as much. They are there to get their employees the skills they need.
- There is a lot of industry that want their employees to gain soft skills but will not send them to take communications course or a writing course.
- These are not anything that cannot be overcome. They just take some time.

In the Healthcare industry, do they pay apprentices for time in the classroom?

- A very generous employer writes in to the standards that they will pay for so many hours a week while they are at school. Not all employers do that. With unions it must be written into the standards and voted on. There is not a best practice for this. It is up to the employer.
- Texas was one of the first states to have a large number of healthcare companies registered.

Teresa has agreed to share their crosswalks and additional information with the Committee.

Discussion:

Depending on the pathway there could be great interest from the employers. We need to be mindful of the programs that we are talking about and ensuring that all the national certifications are recognized. There is a struggle specifically in the truck driving industry. If they have already earned their CDL license, gaining an apprenticeship certificate is not always seen as an added benefit to the employee.

What careers are we talking about working with to get credit?

- Existing apprenticeship programs in each region that are not able to receive credit for their apprenticeship.
- There are some solid medical and aerospace programs in North Idaho that we could work with.
 - We would need to call upon the college to tell us who we should bring together, what they want to work on, etc. and then Department of Labor can feed them additional resources and contacts.
 - It would be helpful to look at Texas for best practices on healthcare programs. Ms. Fletcher and Mr. Russ have also been working with the healthcare industry.
 - Employers are very interested in healthcare, but it is so new that there are a lot of questions.

LCSC is very interested in offering credit for apprenticeships. In order to remain flexible and move in and out of these programs they would need to develop a self-funded program for apprenticeships. This would allow the freedom and flexibility to offer these credits. The Apprenticeship Committee could be a great advocate for it.

- Mr. San Miguel and Ms. Stricklin can look to see if there is board policy on this issue.

BRAD LITTLE
GOVERNOR

Wendi Secrist
Executive Director



Trent Clark
Chair

B. J. Swanson
Vice Chair

WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL

317 West Main Street, Boise, Idaho 83735-0510

There is a concern with requiring all apprentices to get a degree. This could be a barrier to some people. There are definitely advantages to having a degree on top of a journeyman, but we do not want to limit anyone from getting their journeyman.

- It is important to communicate that a degree is a great addition to an apprenticeship certificate, but we want to avoid pitting an apprenticeship against a degree.

It is important to note that Mr. Hague (student from Ivy Tech) heard about the apprenticeship program from a friend. It was not through print, social media, the web, etc. Mr. Hague also valued having a degree because his whole family had a degree.

There is a challenge with programs that are workforce development programs only and not a credit bearing program. CSI has been working on creating a template for a statewide associates in apprenticeship.

CWI is acting as the sponsor for the Cloverdale Plumbing Federal Apprenticeship. They would be a great resource to the other institutions.

As we are developing the crosswalk for credit for apprenticeships this could be a great opportunity to utilize SkillStack.

It was very telling that Mr. Hauge did his apprenticeship in Pocatello and had to go out of state to receive the degree he wanted. This was definitely a missed opportunity for Idaho.

One of the challenges for ISU is to market the availability of the AAS program at their institution. ISU is going to also be doing some research into why apprentices are not finishing their 4-year degrees. They are hoping to talk with students about why it is important to finish their associate's degree.

Is it possible that with the attrition rate are they leaving town?

- At ISU the plumbing program is where they see the least amount of retention. Part of it has to do with once you get the apprenticeship card it can be renewed for a long period of time. It just seems to be that as they move further in the program they find different work or go a different occupation route.
- Some of the people could be picked up by the unions.
- People may also get into the programs and then realize that this is not the career for them.

CEI has traditional HVAC, Plumbing, and Electrical programs. The conversion of those graduating apprentices and then going on to get their AAS is very small. They are generally only 2-3 apprentices a year who ask about the transition into the AAS program. They are working with the Idaho Falls Fire Department to approve an employee advancement program. They are working on gather information about what general education courses the employees needs to then create a 3-year plan.

It is important to know that these options are available to them up front. We want them to be able to get the gen ed credits and do what they need to do to complete their apprenticeship at the same time they are finishing

BRAD LITTLE
GOVERNOR

Wendi Secrist
Executive Director



Trent Clark
Chair

B. J. Swanson
Vice Chair

WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL

317 West Main Street, Boise, Idaho 83735-0510

their degree. Sometimes it takes someone going through the program to then figure out that they want to go back and get their degree.

For apprenticeships do we have to have an expiration date on these opportunities?

- Mr. Woolsey currently has someone going through the program who got his apprenticeship around 30 years ago and is now wanting to go back and get is AAS form Ivy Tech.
- The institutions do not feel that they need to have an expiration date either.
- IT Apprenticeships and others do have some skills that “expire” so this cannot be a universal expectation for all programs.

It is a good idea to utilize the associate degree linked to the apprenticeship to draw in the younger generation who may not have looked at a trade or who may have been discouraged from pursuing a trade.

Ivy Tech had great outreach ideas.

- Utilizing graduates/apprentices to market the programs
- Sponsor sporting events

We also need to continue the efforts to work closely with CTE. It was impressive how closely Ivy Tech and their secondary CTE system worked together.

The Dennis Tech Center applied for a national grant through the Partnership on Advancing Youth Apprenticeship. The grant provides up to \$200,000 and they are a finalist. They have a week to develop a budget and will have an interview with one of their teams. There were over 200+ applicants across the country and they will be choosing 6-8 to receive grants.

Ivy Tech Graduate Experience

Mr. Hague joined the call to discuss his experience being part of Ivy Tech.

He went through a 4-year apprenticeship in Pocatello. He needed a distance learning program due to work requiring him to travel outside the state. He was also able to get college credit for his work experience. He was taught many valuable skills that helped him get where he is today – he could not have been promoted to his position without a degree on top of his journeyman license. He is currently in LA working on the LA Rams Stadium as a safety technician.

Most of the members of his family were college graduates and he desired to be one as well. The Ironworkers apprenticeship really helped guide him towards what he was looking for. He always has had an appreciation for safety. Degrees are essential these days to be able to move up in your chosen degree field.

How did you hear about Ivy Tech?

BRAD LITTLE
GOVERNOR

Wendi Secrist
Executive Director



Trent Clark
Chair

B. J. Swanson
Vice Chair

WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL

317 West Main Street, Boise, Idaho 83735-0510

- While going through his apprenticeship with Ironworkers it was listed as an option. He had heard Ivy Tech provided the opportunity to leverage the apprenticeship program to receive college credit. That was a deciding factor to him.

How did you hear about the apprenticeship program?

- He heard by word of mouth. A friend was helping him figuring out what occupations might be a good fit for him and he was told about the Ironworkers Program.

Areas of Interest that might draw students into the programs:

- Introduce apprenticeships at a younger age (career fairs) – they are a way to make a good living. It is a high-demand field. In the coming years we are going to have a lot of infrastructure needs.
- Show them that they are able to support themselves. There are a lot of people who are unsure of what path they want to take. There are more opportunities that can branch from the apprenticeship path.

When did you go through the Ivy Tech Program?

- 2013-2016

If you had not had your associates or bachelor's degree would your company have moved you into the position you are in?

- Without the degrees he feels that he might have been overlooked in the hiring process. In his field there is a saturation of people who just have certificates.

How much additional coursework did you do at Ivy Tech to get your bachelor's degree?

- About 3-years' worth. It would have been a little longer if he did not already have college credits.

WDTF Quantitative Funding Model Request from Policy Committee

The Policy Committee asked the Apprenticeship Committee to provide feedback on a concern that occupational licenses were being valued below degree, apprenticeships, and certificates.

The committee is really interested in supporting work-based learning and recognizes that Registered Apprenticeships are the gold standard. The Committee discussed only having three scoring categories and moving occupational licenses up with the certificates, degree, and Registered Apprenticeships. There were mixed feelings about doing that. Ms. Secrist proposed that we move occupational licenses up into the 10 point category and then offer a bonus of 5 additional points for Registered Apprenticeships which would move an applicant up one funding tier. This would show that we value occupational licenses, but are encouraging businesses to establish registered apprenticeship programs.

- By doing a Registered Apprenticeship, the employer is doing more and investing more into the program so that should be rewarded.

BRAD LITTLE
GOVERNOR

Wendi Secrist
Executive Director



Trent Clark
Chair

B. J. Swanson
Vice Chair

WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL

317 West Main Street, Boise, Idaho 83735-0510

CWI has received a lot of requests from employers for customized training. How does that fit into the new scoring model?

- Unless certifications are included it would be scored as structured on-the-job training.
- The use of a scale has not changed from how the Department of Labor started doing it in 2014. However, the scale was extended to provide specific amounts for scores below 40 points and the upper end was lowered to \$4,000 per job. It was a good catch that the occupational licenses were not being viewed as transferrable as the degrees and registered apprenticeships.
- The Council established that the purpose of the training fund is to help lift the workforce across the state. Portability is very important. SOJT is still important, but we are valuing training that provides increased transferability more. This is not preventing employers from getting grants, they may just not be getting as much in funding.

How much does the 60% goal play with out committee and the Council?

- This is something to keep in mind when we are developing objectives. We are showing that we value apprenticeships and that they are just as important as other forms of education.

The Committee is in favor of suggesting the "bonus" points for registered apprenticeship while moving occupational licenses up to score 10 points.

Strategic Plan Objectives

The Council staff will put together a survey to gather suggestions the objectives so that the committee has a starting point during their June meeting.

Motion by Mr. Russ to adjourn. Second by Ms. Lundberg.
Adjourned at 3:52 pm