

C.L. "BUTCH" OTTER  
GOVERNOR



Trent Clark  
*Chair*  
B. J. Swanson  
*Vice Chair*

## WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL

317 West Main Street, Boise, Idaho 83735-0510

### Meeting Minutes

**Date:** Jan. 11, 2018  
**Time:** 9:00 a.m. - 4:30 p.m. (Mountain Time)  
**Location:** Idaho West Ballroom  
Oxford Suites  
1426 S Entertainment Ave, Boise, ID 83709  
**Meeting Conducted By:** Trent Clark, Chairman

**Attendees:** Trent Clark, BJ Swanson, Shelli Bardsley, Donna Butler, Linda Clark, Jane Donnellan, Audrey Fletcher, Dave Hannah, Marie Hattaway, Angela Hemingway, Steinar Hjelle, Deni Hoehne, Mark Holubar, Dwight Johnson, Kelly Kolb, Kate Lenz, Jeff McCray, Deanna McCutcheon, Bobbi-Jo Meuleman, Bret Moffett, Todd Monroe, Jan Nielsen, Angelique Rood, Todd Schwarz, John Smith, Melinda Smyser, Michelle Stennett, Scott Syme, Mark Tattershall, Matt Van Vleet, Joe Maloney, Steve Widmyer, Ken Wiesmore, Lori Wolff, Travis Woolsey, John Young

**Staff Attendees:** Wendi Secrist, Paige Nielebeck

\*Workforce Development Council is hereafter referred to as WDC

Quorum is met

**Call to order at 9:00 am**

**Welcome & Introductions**

Chairman Clark read a welcome message from Governor Otter

John Bailey and Carol Padovan are in attendance from the US Department of Labor office in San Francisco.

**The Role of the WDC**

Dwight Johnson, Brian Whitlock and Matt Freeman were introduced to provide an overview of where the WDC has been and what its role is moving forward.

See attached presentation.

## Questions/Discussion

Panel:

Dwight Johnson shared a short history of public employment programs in the US.

- In 1933 the passage of the Wagner-Peyser Act created employment services in every state.
- This was to help assure people who were receiving unemployment benefits would get off the benefits as quickly as possible to get them in the workforce
- The progression of acts was as follows:
  - Manpower Development Training Act
  - Comprehensive Employment Training Act (CETA)
  - Job Training Partnership Act (JTPA)
  - Workforce Investment Act (WIA)
  - Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA)
- The focus is trying to bring together all the federal funded programs to seamlessly deliver services to individuals & employers.
- Under WIA there were 6 regional workforce investment boards.
- In 2004, there was a reduction in federal funding for WIA programs. The state made a proposal to limit overhead and administration rather than stop serving individuals. The local workforce enforcement boards were consolidated and the state WDC assumed responsibility for oversight.
- On the state side, in 1996 there was an increased focus on creating a skilled workforce in Idaho, to expand training resources in the state. The Legislature passed a bill providing that 3% of unemployment insurance goes to a workforce development training fund (WDTF)
- Since that time the Workforce Development Council has been authorized to oversee the Workforce Development Training Fund

Brian Whitlock shared the Governor's Workforce Development Taskforce's recommendations.

- A year ago, the Governor had proposed a reduction in unemployment insurance which would in turn reduce the amount going towards the Workforce Training Fund. Concerns had been voiced about whether the state was adequately investing in workforce development.
- On January 18 the taskforce was announced and they met twice a month for 4 months
- The Governor had suggested an infusion of \$5 million in general funds to enhance the ability of industry in Idaho to grow and the Legislature appropriated \$2.5 million to carry out the recommendations of the Taskforce.
- There were 4 areas of focus for the taskforce
  - Industry, Education, and Government Partnerships
  - Capacity building
  - Career Advising
  - Communications
- From those areas the taskforce developed 9 recommendations (see recommendations in the Workforce Development Taskforce report)

Chairman Clark: Shared that the role of the council is to ensure these recommendations are carried out. He, along with Matt Freeman and Dwight Johnson provided a status update on each recommendation.

Questions/comments:

- **Dr. Clark:** sometimes good ideas are lost over time. Back in 1994 passed a bill that appropriated money to infuse vocational education into all education. They worked very hard on this for about a year, but the Idaho Achievement Standards pushed this out the door.
  
- **Ms. Hemingway:** Does this legislation only incentivize CTE and if a student chooses a different route are they not workforce ready? Do we have enough CTE teachers? How do we allow more academic teachers to receive this cross training?
  - **Mr. Johnson:** This is a process we will have to work on. Initially this will focus on CTE, but in the future, will be able to infuse any work-based learning into the curriculum. Teacher availability is a huge issue. In CTE we pull from the private sector to teach the CTE programs in which they have occupational technical experience. CTE has now created a cohort for teachers to gain the skills and knowledge they need for the classroom. This comes at no expense to the teachers. Teachers still have the option to pay and take classes instead of the cohort. We need to address cross-training more heavily in the State.
  
- **Ms. Fletcher:** National Vocational Qualifications, used in the UK, could be used as a method of measuring workforce readiness.
  - **Mr. Johnson:** We do not have anything like this in the US, but it is underway. Idaho SkillStack is CTE's badging system that is establishing learning outcomes.
  - **Ms. Secrist:** There are over 1,000 apprenticeship occupations that have national standards

### **Building a Dashboard**

#### **Craig Shaul presented on the Economic Update and Forecast (IDOL)**

See attached presentation. No Questions or comments.

#### **Salvador Vasquez presented on the Workforce Development Training Fund Evaluation & Fund Balance Projections**

See attached presentation.

Questions/Discussion

- **Chairman Clark:** Do we know if these are people leaving or being promoted?
  - **Mr. Vasquez:** We can only see whether they are employed.
- **Chairman Clark:** We will be able to distribute the final report to the council?
  - **Mr. Vasquez:** Yes, we will share that out to the council.

- **Dr. Schwarz:** There should be a discussion of the applications process for Sector Grants and Micro Grants.
- **Ms. Rood:** Are there metrics in place for Sector and Micro Grants?
  - **Ms. Secrist:** Currently we do not, but we will need a committee to look at the policy of the WDTF and a separate committee to award from the WDTF.
- **Ms. Hattaway:** How many applications were declined?
  - There will be a graphic created that represents this information and will be sent to the council members.

### **Jay Larson Presents on the Idaho Knowledge Report (Idaho Technology Council)**

See attached presentation. No Questions or Comments.

### **Jessica Ruehrwein presents on Senior Exit Survey (TVEP)**

See attached presentation. No Questions or Comments.

### **Journey to Career presentation by Caty Solace**

Ms. Solace shared efforts that are underway at ICTE to develop assets (i.e. videos, pictures, etc.) to support outreach efforts. She also shared recent research released by ACTE on how to connect to youth.

### **WDC Staffing Plan – presented by Ms. Secrist**

See attached presentation. No Questions or Comments.

### **Bylaws/Governance Structure – presented by Mr. Young**

- We will not vote on bylaws today; please review between now and the April meeting and provide feedback

### **Questions/Discussion**

- **Mr. Johnson:** Committees can include non-council members, correct?
  - **Mr. Young:** That is correct. The intent is to have non-council members be on the committees
- **Dr. Schwarz:** There is a budget now for this new state agency. The budget shows \$8.9 million. Should fiscal reporting be added to the bylaws?
  - **Ms. Secrist:** These are funds shifting from the Idaho Department of Labor to the WDC. There are \$860,00 in operating expenses and the rest is Workforce Development Training fund spending authority. She will talk to the Governor's Office about the fiscal reporting.

### **WDC Responsibilities**

Ms. Secrist provided an overview of the WDC responsibilities.

See attached presentation. No Questions or Comments.

### **Proposed WDC Committees – presented by Wendi Secrist**

Ms. Secrist reviewed the Committee Proposal (see attached document).

1. Executive Committee
  - a. **Mr. Johnson:** Who is the Executive Committee?
    - i. **Ms. Secrist:** Trent Clark, BJ Swanson, Deni Hoehne, Jeff McCray, John Young
  - b. **Mr. Monroe:** Is there an existing strategy we are working off?
    - i. **Ms. Secrist:** there is a previous strategic plan that was created in 2014 that we should look at. The April meeting will focus primarily on strategy.
  - c. **Ms. Hemingway:** Are we choosing a committee today?
    - i. **Ms. Secrist:** Today you are just learning about the committees. Ms. Secrist plans to meet with each council member to discuss any questions.
  - d. **Dr. Schwarz:** Is the council setting the strategy or is it a separate committee? Some of this strategy may require a change to public policy. Are we going to be making specific requests for public policy?
    - i. **Ms. Secrist:** It is the council setting the strategy. We will have to work with the Governor's Office on the public policy issues.
2. Workforce Development Training Fund Committee
  - a. **Ms. Swanson:** The bureaucracy needs to be decreased and the process needs to be competitive and efficient
  - b. This committee will be addressing formal policy for the Eligible Training Provider list, as part of the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act, over the next few meetings. Then work will shift to the WDTF.
3. One-Stop Committee
  - a. This committee is primarily responsible for ensuring WIOA's vision is carried out
  - b. All agency partners need to be represented on this committee
  - c. We also need to see the user (i.e. participants and employers) perspective to make sure the system is working effectively
4. Apprenticeship Committee
  - a. **Ms. Rood (chair):** Goals of this committee include increasing the number of apprenticeships, increasing public awareness, and establishing college credit for apprenticeships.
  - b. We need to have a cohesive and common definition of apprenticeship
  - c. **Mr. Johnson:** It might be smarter to change the name of the committee to "work-based learning".
    - i. **Ms. Rood:** We might lose traction and detract from the registered apprenticeships. We would like to maintain focus on registered apprenticeships for now and review in 6-12 months.
5. Youth Committee
  - a. Idaho's Youth Committee has come together to focus on providers of youth services in Idaho and where do we want to invest our limited funds

- b. **Dr. Clark:** This committee would function best on an ad-hoc basis. The outreach committee will likely put a focus on youth and the Youth Committee can assist as needed.
- 6. Grant Review Committee
  - a. The Grant Review Committee would be responsible for making recommendations on funding proposals
  - b. We need to avoid conflicts of interest. To avoid this, it is suggested that we have a core team of grant reviewers, with a pool of alternates to ensure we can draw appropriate reviewers as needed.
- 7. Outreach Committee
  - a. This is a new function for the council and not a previously existing committee
  - b. **Ms. Rood:** Will there be guidance from the Executive Committee on how many members, etc.?
    - i. **Ms. Secrist:** it will be a process we engage the council on. The chairman will appoint people to the committees as discussed with the council.

There will be staff support for all the committees. Paige Nielebeck will attend committee meetings and take minutes. She will support all the chairpersons and take care of the logistics for the committee meetings.

#### Questions/Discussion:

- **Dr. Schwarz:** Should there be a WIOA Committee?
  - **Ms. Secrist:** The One-Stop Committee serves that purpose. We can add this if we feel certain things are not being addressed.

#### Action Agenda

##### *Update from Executive Committee*

The Executive Committee reviewed two applications.

- The Grant Review Committee recommended that House of Design be funded at \$98,000. The average wage for employees would be \$31.78/hr.
  - House of Design application was unanimously approved by the Executive Committee
- The Grant Review Committee recommended that Pipl be funded at \$625,000. The average wage for employees would be \$25.59/hr.
  - The Pipl application was also unanimously approved by the Executive Committee

#### Discussion

- **Mr. Woolsey:** Is there a way of tracking the education that these employees are receiving and what training they are receiving?
  - **Ms. Secrist:** They must submit a training plan with the application and when they submit reimbursement requests we match that up with the training plan and use SSNs to ensure individuals are employees of the company.

- **Mr. Wiesmore:** Are the skills transferrable if they leave these specific companies?
  - **Ms. Meuleman:** We are trying to attract more jobs like these, even though right now, there are not a lot of technical positions like this in Idaho (with respect to Pipl).
- **Ms. Lenz:** There are 2 jobs posted in Post Falls today for Pipl, but they are headquartered in Israel. All the Engineering jobs are in Israel. Where are their headquarters located?
  - **Mr. Young:** Their goal is to move more of their engineering jobs to the US.
  - **Ms. Meuleman:** The company is headquartered in Israel, but their US base is in Post Falls.
- **Ms. Smyser:** We want to support Idaho companies, but need to balance how to attract companies to Idaho to provide higher paying jobs.
- **Mr. Young:** Pipl is comparable to bringing HP to the Treasure Valley area. This is an opportunity to bring another big employer to the area. This could be an amazing opportunity for Post Falls.

*Minutes from October 25, 2017*

Motion by Mr. Wiesmore to approve the minutes from the October 25, 2017 meeting as written. Second by Mr. Johnson. Motion carried.

***Workforce Development Training Fund – Policy Request – presented by Ms. Swanson***

Ms. Swanson shared a memo from the WDTF Committee. Amy's Kitchen is asking for a policy change to consider the value of medical and other benefits to meet the wage threshold to lower or to lower the programs wage threshold to \$11 an hour. It is the recommendation of the WDTF Committee that Amy's Kitchen request be denied.

Members expressed the following comments:

- The current policy is a sound policy and we should support keeping it intact
- There have been numerous discussions of this policy. If you are going to provide public dollars for training, the result needs to be pay substantially higher than minimum wage
- The median wage for food service is \$15 an hour.
- The livable wage for a 2 children family is \$21/hr.
  - Ms. Secrist shared that health benefits are a requirement under the WDTF. The value of the benefits is not included in the wage to meet that threshold.
- Should we raise the threshold from \$12 an hour and consider benefits packages?

Ms. Swanson made a motion to deny the requests made in the memo. Second by Mr. Wiesmore. Motion carried.

**Workforce Development Initiatives**

***Idaho Department of Labor – Presented by Melinda Smyser***

- IDOL has 3 pieces of legislation
  - Unemployment Insurance Tax – lowering from 1.5% to 1.3% (this will allow the organizations to pay their employees more)
  - Workforce Development Council will be its own agency

- CIS moving to State Board of Education
- We have 24,000 jobs that cannot be filled
- We have 97% of our available labor force working
- IDOL received a grant from the US DOL for apprenticeship
  - They have doubled their registered apprenticeship programs around the state
- North Idaho Program: train 135 people with funds from Workforce Training
- Idaho Hispanic youth summit – they are focusing on healthcare for these students
- IDOL collects and shares data. Many different people use their data to attract people to come to Idaho.

***US Department of Labor –presented by John Bailey***

- Impressed with the function of this board
- The board embodies what this is all about – the partnerships and alignment
- The review and update of the WIOA State Plan is extremely important. USDOL is expecting this mid to late March.
- USDOL does have oversight responsibilities, but feels the best approach is a partnership. They are here to help us. Provide technical assistance on anything we need.

***Idaho Division of Vocational Rehabilitation – Jane Donnellan***

- They assist individuals with disabilities who are eligible for their program. Allows individuals to pursue self-sufficiency, being part of the community
- 38.3% of individuals disabled were employed
- Idaho ranked 15 in the nation for the number of disabled individuals being employed
- Reviewed line item budget requests for Legislative session

***Idaho Department of Health and Welfare – Presented by Laurie Wolf***

- 367,000 Idahoans are eligible for Medicaid
- 250,000 are eligible for the SNAP Food Stamp program
- SNAP: There is a work requirement for this program. You either must be working or be in a work training program
- About half of those able-bodied adults are working, but they are working in lower wage jobs
- About 33,000 fall into the category of not working or not meeting the working requirements
- We are carrying legislation to support a new program in Idaho. The 50-50 match program develops community partnerships (industry, workforce, government) to draw down 50% federal funds to match with state and private funds. Washington pulls down \$32 million in this program from the federal government, and Idaho pulls nothing. There is no limit to the amount of funding we can pull down. It requires technology and MOUs, but we are excited about the opportunity.
- The hardest things for individuals is to navigate the bureaucracy. We need to make information easily accessible and simplify for our consumers. This is a conversation we will continue to work on with the One-Stop Committee.

**Idaho Office of the State Board of Education – Presented by Dr. Linda Clark**

- The Higher Ed Taskforce recalibrated the 60% goal. Moved the target out to 2025. We need to rearticulate that goal. There is a lack of understanding. Our goal is not for everyone to have a Bachelor's degree.
- Moving CIS to the State Board will help align efforts.
- Budget Requests:
  - College and Career advising – additional \$5 million
  - Advanced Opportunities – additional \$8 million – total \$15 million
    - The board is ensuring that these are direct transfer credit
  - Idaho Opportunity Scholarship – additional \$5 million, 20% of the money to be used for adult completer scholarship
  - Postsecondary degree audit data analytics system – additional \$350,000
  - 32 full time faculty and 32 part-time faculty for CEI - \$3.2 million
  - Construction of Health Sciences facility at CWI - \$10 million

**STEM Action Center – Presented by Angela Hemingway**

- Bridge into education and industry
- Impacted 200,000 students in Idaho
- Worked with nearly 5,000 educators
- Anticipate \$600,000 in industry contributions
- Kids leak out of the STEM pipeline when they are young and are not returning to that pipeline
- Computer Science Initiative: computer science co-op program with NIC and U of I
- Expanding BSU's I do Code program
- Working with U of I to increase the numbers of dual credit teachers
- Virtual Online Mentorship Portal
- STEM Action Center Foundation was created.
- STEM Day at the Capitol – January 23

**Idaho Department of Commerce – Presented by Bobbi-Jo Meuleman**

- Business Retention Expansion Division – goal is to get out and meet with businesses to find out their challenges and needs. They made over 500 visits in the past year.
- Legislation: Bringing back bill that they presented last year on data centers.
  - Big data centers want to come here (Amazon, Google, etc.), but we tax equipment that has to be replaced frequently.
  - This addresses new data centers to Idaho and co-location data centers
- Budget: line item request for Tourism. It is the third largest industry in the state
  - Asking for another \$3.5 million spending authority – the funds are generated through room tax.

**Idaho Career and Technical Education – Presented by Dwight Johnson**

- All their Legislative priorities are based on the recommendations from the Workforce Development Taskforce, as mentioned this morning

- Legislature appropriated \$10 million from the permanent building fund and was matched by LCSC to build a new CTE facility in Lewiston. The local school district is going to be opening a new high school with a CTE center that is right next to LCSC.
- Idaho Falls passed a bond to create a community college (CEI)
- ISU Technical College has a private donor to move all the CTE programs to a new facility which in turn will expand these programs
- CWI working to build a Health Sciences Building

***Idaho State Department of Education – Presented by Duncan Robb***

- Legislative Open house is January 22
- Budget Requests:
  - Additional \$46 million for teacher salary increase
  - \$19 million for discretionary funds (to cover health insurance costs)
  - \$8.5 million for classroom technology
  - Mastery Education: \$1.4 million line item for schools who are changing to a mastery based curriculum. Total of \$2.8 million
  - Rural schools initiative – asked legislature to support a project that would allow districts to share resources
  - In total asked for a 6.8% increase in the public school budgets

**Chair's Closing Remarks**

We have the opportunity now to make real change!

*2018 Meeting Schedule*

April 5

July 18

October 24

**Adjourn at 4:16 pm**

Motion made by Dr. Schwarz to adjourn the meeting. Second by Senator Stennett. Motion carried.