

C.L. "BUTCH" OTTER  
GOVERNOR



Trent Clark  
*Chair*  
B. J. Swanson  
*Vice Chair*

## WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL

317 West Main Street, Boise, Idaho 83735-0510

### Meeting Minutes

**Date:** Thursday, April 5, 2018  
**Time:** 9:00 a.m. – 5:00 p.m. (Mountain Time)  
**Location:** Silverstone Amenity Center  
3405 E. Overland Road  
Meridian, ID 83642

**Meeting Conducted By:** B.J. Swanson, Vice Chair

**Attendees:** ~~Trent Clark~~, B.J. Swanson, ~~Shelli Bardsley~~, Donna Butler, Linda Clark, Jane Donnellan, Audrey Fletcher, Dave Hannah, Marie Hattaway, Angela Hemingway, Steinar Hjelle, Deni Hoehne, Mark Holubar, ~~Dwight Johnson~~, Kelly Kolb, ~~Kate Lenz~~, Joe Maloney, Jeff McCray, Deanna McCutcheon, Bobbi-Jo Meuleman, ~~Bret Moffett~~, Todd Monroe, ~~Jan Nielsen~~, Angelique Rood, Todd Schwarz, John Smith, Melinda Smyser, Michelle Stennett, Scott Syme, Matt Van Vleet, Steve Widmyer, Ken Wiesmore, Lori Wolff, Travis Woolsey, John Young, Adrian San Miguel (in attendance for Dwight Johnson)

\*Workforce Development Council is hereafter referred to as WDC

#### Call to order at 9:03 am

#### Welcome & Introductions

Chairman Clark sends his best wishes to the council today. Thank you to Chairman Clark and Monsanto for donating the pens, notepads and cards to the Council.

**Review Agenda** – No changes made

**Roll Call** – Quorum Met

#### Idaho Labor Market Overview – Rural vs. Urban

Ms. Swanson introduced Sam Wolkenhauer for his presentation on the Idaho's Urban-Rural Divide. See attached presentation

Things to Remember:

- Urban Idaho is booming. Rural Idaho is depressed.
- Rural Idaho is at a demographic tipping point

- Wages are very important to rural workers, who often (counterintuitively) face higher costs of living

**Questions from the Council:**

Are the patterns seen in Idaho typical across the nation or just in our state?

- It is typical for the heartland of the US. The demographics and what is happen with migration is very different on the West and East coasts than it is in the interior.

Those who are counted as a commuting county, are they only commuting to places inside Idaho?

- A commuting county does not have to be commuting to a city in Idaho. They could be commuting to a city outside of the state. The counties where there is a large commuting activity are generally urban cities.

How much workforce are we losing to other states because of these commuting counties?

- IDOL has explored this a little bit, but gets the information from the census bureau. They just received the 2015 data so it is hard to give a real-time analysis.

Have you looked at in what industries in rural areas are the millennials filling jobs?

- We have a lot of millennials working in the manufacturing industry, mining, forestry, etc. They are filling the jobs the baby boomers have, but there are not enough of them to fill the jobs because it is expensive to live in these rural areas. Millennials are moving out because of the cost of living in these areas.

Are the kids who are still in high school being counted as part of the millennials?

- A majority of the millennial generation is out of college. We are generally talking about people who are in their 20's or even early 30's.

This is a pretty stable picture of data for the next decade.

It is important to keep in mind the rural and urban nature of Idaho when we are working on developing action plans/strategies.

**Workforce Development Training Fund Report**

Ms. Secrist introduced the Workforce Development Training Fund (WDTF) Report provided to the council members in their folders. Ms. Secrist then went over the WDTF Financial Summary with the council.

As of January 31, the fund balance is just over \$17.5 million.

<b>WDTF Financial Summary for April 2018 Council Meeting</b>	
WDTF Balance 1/31/2018	\$17,595,545.45
Less Active Obligated Balance	\$6,063,235.48

Fund Balance ending 1/31/2018	\$11,532,309.97
Reimbursements to be PD 2/1 - 3/31/18	\$343,905.00
	\$11,188,404.97
Approved Awards Pending Full Execution	\$1,213,248.39
Commitment Letters	\$0.00
Balance Forward	\$9,975,156.58
Pending Applications for WDC Approval	\$2,500,000.00
Pending Apps - Grant Review Approval	\$456,335.19
Expected Apps - w/in next 30 days	\$1,747,812.75
Expected Apps - w/in next 60 days	\$25,000.00
Expected Applications by June 30, 2018	\$525,000.00
Projected Balance	\$4,721,008.64
Less Set Aside for Task Force Recommendations	\$2,500,000.00
<b>Remaining Balance</b>	<b>\$2,221,008.64</b>

Staff and the executive committee are working on a process of how to accommodate business recruitment and expansion projects to provide grant funds. They are looking at Commerce's process of issuing approval/commitment letters as a starting point.

There is an outstanding commitment letter for \$2.5 million for McCain Foods that had been written by the previous Department of Labor Director. There are a few other commitment letters that indicate support for projects, but they do not have a dollar amount attached to them. These businesses were told that they need to apply for the grant and could receive up to \$4,000 per job.

Is the expected applications number based on projects who are looking for refunding?

- No, they are new applications that are currently being worked on.

The 2017 Legislature added \$2.5 million to the WDTF to carry out the recommendation of the Workforce Development Task Force. For FY18, there is not a general fund appropriation, as we have been asked to develop a way to project workforce development funding needs and ask the Legislation for funds only when the needs are greater than the projected balance in the WDTF.

Right now, we operate under the existing programs and processes that were set by the WDC and Department of Labor. Part of our discussion today is looking at these programs and deciding if they are sufficient. We will operate under the existing programs until the Council changes them.

## Employer Grants

- Eligibility: company produces a product or service that is mainly sold outside the region where the business is located or the company is in the health care industry, starting wage is \$12 an hour or more for the new positions being created or positions being retained, company provides employer assisted medical benefits, and company is increasing its current workforce and/or retraining existing workers with skills necessary for specific economic opportunities and industrial expansion initiatives.
- Training reimbursement for new and expanding businesses.
- Prioritizes transferable skills and structured training programs with an education partner.
- Outcomes are measured as part of the application process where scores are given by evaluating:
  - the expected wage gain due to training or educational certificate, occupational license, or degree obtained
  - transferability of skills and occupation to other industries in region
  - regional unemployment rate
  - economic multiplier of industry

## Micro-Grants

- Eligible applicants: community-based organization, school, employer, local government entity or economic development organization can apply on behalf of a community partnership
- \$25,000 maximum award.
- Outcomes are flexible and can be measured by the number of:
  - participants who enter employment within 30 days of training completion
  - participants with a starting hourly wage rate of \$12 an hour or greater
  - of incumbent workers completing retraining
  - of incumbent workers receiving a wage increase with wages over \$12 an hour
  - participants attaining recognized credential/skill badge
  - participants entering postsecondary education after training

## Industry Sector Grants

- Eligible applicants: entity representing a consortium of at least three industry partners with a similar occupational training need; all partners must meet current WDTF business requirements.
- Consortium, together with its training provider, must provide 25 percent cash match of the total grant request or 100 percent in-kind match equal to the total grant request or a proportionate combination of cash and in-kind match.
- The following outcomes will be measured on an individual participant level for the entire grant AND will also be measured on a company level for each consortium partner:

For current employees of the project's business partners (incumbent workers):

- Number of incumbent workers who receive classroom training, complete classroom training, receive structured on-the-job training, complete structured on-the-job training
- Average wage prior to training/average wage after training
- Number attaining recognized credential/skill badge

For other individuals:

- Number of individuals who receive training and who entering training-related employment within 30 days of training completion

- Number of individuals entering training-related employment with one of the project's business partners
- Anticipated average hourly wage of new hires (minimum of \$12/hour)
- Number attaining recognized credential/skill badge

In the packets provided, there is a list of WDTF Applications that were not funded:

**Workforce Development Training Fund - Applications Not Funded 2014-present**

Applicant	City	Application Date	Project Type
<b>Employer Grants</b>			
AmeriBen	Meridian	6/1/2014	Employer Grant
Golden Valley Natural	Idaho Falls	8/4/2014	Employer Grant
Cougar Mountain Software Inc	Boise	1/2/2015	Employer Grant
Printcraft Press, Inc	Idaho Falls	7/13/2015	Employer Grant
Nightforce Optics, Inc.	Orofino	7/16/2015	Employer Grant
Bay Shore Systems	Rathdrum	9/4/2015	Employer Grant
Premier Performance LLC	Rexburg	9/22/2015	Employer Grant
Connexions Loyalty Travel Solutions, LLC	Boise	4/27/2015	Employer Grant
Chobani (Cho-Academy) Mgmt Training	Twin Falls	2/8/2017	Employer Grant
TRANSYSTEMS LLC - Manufacturing		4/7/2017	Employer Grant
<b>Industry Sector Grants</b>			
Boise State University	Boise	3/2/2015	Sector Grant
Idaho State University	Meridian	4/21/2016	Sector Grant
Idaho State University-College of Business	Pocatello	5/10/2016	Sector Grant
Idaho State University	Meridian	7/14/2016	Sector Grant
<b>Micro Grants</b>			
Canyon-Owyhee School Service Agency	Wilder	7/15/2015	Micro Grant
Boise State University Office of Sponsored Programs	Boise	8/5/2015	Micro Grant
Boundary County Library	Bonnors Ferry	8/5/2015	Micro Grant
Boise State University Office of Sponsored Programs	Boise	8/7/2015	Micro Grant
Canyon-Owyhee School Service Agency	Wilder	8/26/2015	Micro Grant
Lewis Clark State College	Lewiston	8/28/2015	Micro Grant
United Way of Treasure Valley	Boise	9/16/2015	Micro Grant
Valley Regional Transit	Meridian	9/16/2015	Micro Grant
Aberdeen High School	Aberdeen	9/30/2015	Micro Grant

Nell J. Redfield Memorial Hospital	Malad	9/30/2015	Micro Grant
SPOT International Services	Caldwell	10/5/2015	Micro Grant
Caribou Memorial Hospital Living Center & Clinics	Soda Springs	10/9/2015	Micro Grant
BiologiQ, Inc.	Idaho Falls	10/9/2015	Micro Grant
Lewis Clark State College	Lewiston	10/16/2015	Micro Grant
Mountain Home Chamber of Commerce	Mountain Home	10/16/2015	Micro Grant
Wayne Brown Institute	Boise	5/13/2016	Micro Grant

Council members suggested that in the future it would be useful to have something that rolls grants up to each sector to show where we are investing our money.

**\*Employer Grant Request – McCain Foods**

Ms. Meuleman gave an overview of the McCain Foods application and explained the recommendation of the Grant Review Committee.

This is a project has been worked on for about 5 years. McCain had the option of expanding their facility in Canada, but chose to expand to Idaho. They brought almost 200 jobs to Burley, Idaho. As technology advances, training is needed for all employees. The committee felt that this was a valuable project. It is great to see an existing Idaho industry grow.

There is a letter of commitment included in the packet from the previous IDOL director saying they will provide \$2.5m in Workforce Development Training Funds if McCain chose to expand to Idaho. Training includes food safety, machine operators, maintenance technicians, and many other areas where workers are in high demand in South Central Idaho.

Motion by Mr. Woolsey to approve the McCain Foods grant application. Second by Mr. Wiesmore. Mr. Schwarz and Mr. McCray shared that they would abstain from voting on this grant. Motion carried.

**Action Planning Overview**

Ms. Secrist went over the plans for the breakout groups. She explained what is expected of each group, the key questions, and how these groups will function.

There has been an amazing amount of progress on carrying out the Taskforce recommendations. The recommendations and a status update are attached to the packets provided to the council members. The Task Force considered these recommendations as a starting point. They expected the Council and other agencies to create an action plan that builds on these recommendations. We anticipate there will be some cross discussion with the groups. Any process concerns should be put in the parking lot. The purpose of the groups is not to create a perfect action plan, but to create action items for the next 90 days. We can then work on those action items and then in July we can discuss what worked, what didn't work, where we need to make adjustments, etc.

**Break: 10:00 am – 10:15 am**

**Action Planning**

The council members and guest broke into 3 groups to discuss outreach, partnerships, and investments. The goal was to come up with a 90-day action plan for each of those topics.

**Lunch: 12:00 pm – 1:00 pm**

**Action Planning Cont.**

The groups continued to work on the 90-day action plans.

**Break: 3:00 pm – 3:15**

### Action Plan Report Out

Each group reported out on the discussion they had and the 90-day action items they came up with in their groups.

#### Partnership Team

Action Item	Council Resources	Non-Council Resources	Metric	Notes
Design a partnership model that aligns state stakeholders in the workforce development field for effective execution of the workforce development strategic plan.	Council staff and others identify best practices	Everyone else: non-profit, community organizations, Trade unions Collective impact	Definition of partnerships created Council identify priority partners – two or three to work within the next 90 days	Partnership model completed by staff and shared with committee.
Sustain effective partnerships by continued focus on the big picture which includes critical statewide and community specifics outcome metrics.	Council may be setting some of the metrics Taskforce metrics Council monies WIOA		Council members agree to 2 outreach efforts in the first 90 days – prepared presentations	Short presentation for the Council exists: structure and what has changed, goals and feedback.  Background on the workforce in Idaho and where we are
Improve alignment between industry, stakeholders (E.G associations, trade assoc., chambers) and workforce development training centers		Directors of Workforce Training Centers Directors for JATC	WDC will organize business roundtable in selected communities Engage the grant recipient to reach out to others in their industry as part of the grant award.	

List statewide workforce development stakeholders and inventory programs and efforts regarding workforce development.	Council staff	US DOL Economic Development CTE Commerce Libraries	Selected committee will develop a method	Talked to Wendi
Inventory of the High demand and hard to fill job data (real time)	Department of Labor	Associations Idaho Leaders in Nursing	Given to responsible party	

### Investments Team

Action Item	Council Resources	Non-Council Resources	Metric	Notes
<p>Collect more data and do an analysis on the WDTF</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Return on investment – how many people do we train, how many do we retain, average wage at placement, wages out, etc.</li> <li>What industries did the funds go to – occupations, programs</li> <li>What is happening with our labor force? Where are the gaps we are not filling (who has not received funding that needs it)?</li> <li>Where is the workforce undertrained?</li> <li>Crosswalk of Taskforce Recommendations to find out which already have funding under the current structure</li> <li>What are the top 10 industries to target for WTF according to need?</li> <li>Where in Idaho are the funds going?</li> <li>What are the state’s ideas about where we are going to grow our economy, where we should be growing our economy?</li> <li>Information about the block chains</li> <li>Regional data on each individual region’s workforce need</li> <li>Are we creating new jobs or raising up people in lower skills jobs into higher skills jobs?</li> <li>How many people are coming into the workforce?</li> <li>What industries are those projected shortages in?</li> </ul>	WDTF Evaluation Report			Send out WDTF Evaluation Report to team members. Team members to provide specific questions for follow-up. Schedule call with IDOL staff who prepared evaluation.

Survey all council members for their opinion on the WDTF	WDC Staff			
Have a discussion with the Department of Education about what options there are for supporting mastery based education and workforce readiness	WDC Executive Committee?			Tied to Task Force Recommendation on Workforce Readiness
Develop a list of what adult short term training programs are available and the demand for those programs. How many people are already in these programs. How do the programs align with in-demand occupations?				Tied to Task Force Recommendation on Adult Short-Term Training Scholarship Program
Research the effectiveness of the apprenticeship programs that have already been funded by ApprenticeshipIdaho grant and how other states are working with apprenticeships.	Apprenticeship Committee			Tied to Task Force Recommendation on Apprenticeship

**Parking Lot Topics:**

- Making the grant application process easier and more transparent
- Policy Committee: How can we make the grant application process more timely so it moves at the pace industry wants to move at?

**Outreach**

Action Item	Council Resources	Non-Council Resources	Metric	Notes
Hire an outreach coordinator	WDC staff and executive committee	DHR	Define and prioritize audience by next council meeting; evaluate personas we have within 30 days of when we define audiences.	
Develop and prioritize audiences. Then develop personas.	Outreach coordinator	State resources – industry, agencies,	Hire as quickly as state hiring process allows	Top priority; other action items contingent on filling this position
Create asset map	Outreach coordinator, outreach committee	State resources – industry, agencies,	Completion of map	
Develop targeted message for each audience	Outreach committee	Public relations firm, PIOs at agencies, Idaho Public TV	Message completed; ready for final production	

### Notes from Discussion:

- Recommend statewide model for college/career advising (systemness)
- Prioritize funding for rural areas
- Analyze data available now to see what's working and what's not working
- **Toolkit**; best practices
- **Evaluation** needs a timeframe – how to fund, move forward (WDC has some discretionary funds)
- Engage with parents
- Transitioning adults (public campaign needs to include this audience)
- Work with academic counselors
- Easier pathway to get teachers CT endorsed
- 1, 2, 4 and more and apprenticeship
- Who are the personas? What do the audiences care about?
- Non-traditional route – vocational qualifications (educate people that nontraditional route is as valuable)
- Is the messaging industry led, sector led? What are their biggest needs?
- 1<sup>st</sup> step – identify key audiences/ personas – this could be done in 60-90 days

### Internal outreach (with other partners) – identify who is doing what; is it working?

- What = by demographic/age group (veterans, students, underemployed, adults)
- What = career development engagement
- Committee to see what other states/countries are doing for adults
- Asset map (could help show where the gaps are, who is missing)
- Council role is to coordinate and collaborate

### External outreach - identify key audiences/ personas, be strategic about advertising

- What are the stories that need to be told? (Be careful not to showcase stories where opportunities don't exist)
- Partner with YourFit? Expand statewide
- Reach out to industry – target areas we know have shortages; soft skills

### Identify audiences

- Who is going to fill the workforce?
- How do we reach them?
- What do we want them to do?
- What do they value?

### Develop personas

- What is group's goal? Develop and implement statewide public information initiative to increase awareness of career opportunities and the training/education pathways to access them.
- Build value proposition; give them data to make informed choice.

### \*Approve Minutes from January 11, 2018 WDC Meeting

Motion by Ms. Clark to approve minutes. Second by Mr. Schwarz. Motion carried.

### Update from Executive Committee

Ms. Secrist went over the sheet that showed each of the agenda items the Executive Committee has worked on. The Executive Committee wants to maintain transparency with the full council and will be reporting in this manner at each meeting.

Questions were posed about the options to write letters of commitment.

- In the past the Director of Labor or Commerce could approve these grants. With the council having the authority to approve these employer grants, we must have a process to do this in a timely manner. Staff had a discussion in March to talk about the way Commerce provides letters of commitment for the Tax Reimbursement Incentive. Please provide feedback or insight to Ms. Secrist as soon as possible. We want to make sure the council is playing an effective role in these commitments.

### **\*Bylaws Update**

The final draft of the bylaws were provided in Council packets and had been sent out in excess of 7 days in advance. In addition, Ms. Secrist met with each Council member individually and discussed questions/ideas on the bylaws.

Motion by Mr. McCray to approve the bylaws as written. Second by Mr. Young. Motion carried.

### **\*American Job Center Certification Policy**

Ms. Donnellan gave a brief overview of the AJC Policy.

WIOA requires that the state board set assessment criteria in the State Plan for the local boards to use to certify one-stop centers and one-stop delivery systems operated in the local areas. The law and regulations specify the operations of the one-stop centers and the type of criteria used to assess them.

The governance of Idaho's workforce system is centralized under the Idaho Workforce Development Council, which serves as both the state board and local board. Policies made at the state level have to be broad enough to allow flexibility in service delivery at the local level. While the one-stop delivery system is intended to be a local collaboration, Idaho proposes a statewide framework that addresses varying levels of partner coordination in different locations and still provides consistency in quality service delivery to its citizens across the state. The policy proposes that the comprehensive and affiliate centers complete a self-assessment.

Motion by Ms. Donnellan to approve the American Job Center Certification Policy as written. Second by Mr. Widmyer. Motion carried.

### **Chair's Closing Remarks**

Correction on Financial Report to Employer Grant

- The Frulact Grant was approved, but then the employer decided not to choose Idaho so the funds were never used. They had considered the Magic Valley because of Chobani, but there were a lot of issues that convinced them not to move to Idaho. This does not affect the balance sheet. The financial records do require that we show that the funds were allocated, but not spent. It was excluded from the obligated balance.

Ms. Swanson thanked everyone for coming and participating in the break out groups. It is interesting to see how all the group conversations overlapped in what we need to do.

Next meeting will be on July 18 in Boise, Idaho.

**Adjourn at 3:51**

**Motion by Mr. Schwarz to adjourn. Motion carried.**